

National Plan for Music Education (England) 2020 to 2030 Music Education Council Survey Final report June 2018

Richard Hallam

Chair of the Music Education Council

June 2018

National Plan for Music Education 2020 to 2030 (England) Music Education Council Survey Final report June 2018

Key findings

There was overwhelming support for all children to have access to high quality music provision in the Early Years.

There was very strong agreement that music should be an entitlement for all young people in the years of compulsory schooling

Respondents agreed or strongly agreed that young people should have opportunities to:

- Build on early years' experiences and 'catch up' where these were not currently available (unanimous);
- Create and compose;
- Sing and play instruments together;
- Listen to music;
- Learn about music;
- Critically engage with music;
- o Explore the many different kinds of music;
- o Progress and develop (unanimous); and
- Engage fully with quality experiences that enable the individual to make informed choices and fulfil their potential (unanimous).

There was overwhelming agreement that teachers should have strong subject knowledge, keep their knowledge up-to-date, and have the skills and understanding to be able to:

- Adapt teaching to respond to the strengths and needs of all pupils;
- Plan and teach well-structured lessons;
- o Promote good progress and outcomes by pupils; and
- Set high expectations which inspire, motivate and challenge pupils.

There was overwhelming agreement that music is diverse; that schools should be partners within their local Music Education Hubs; and that the Hub's rolling development plans should facilitate effective strategic planning and operational delivery that meet the needs of all young people in the local area, linking with further opportunities regionally and nationally as appropriate.

There was overwhelming agreement that high quality music education supports lifelong participation in, and enjoyment of, music; that, for some young people, school music education will end at 14; and that for others, it will continue and may lead to a music related career. All options should be open to all.

Executive Summary

Introduction

This survey built on a series of seminars, working groups and individual conversations that took place over the past 18 months. The survey set out to establish the level of agreement across the sector with a number of statements about music education in order to support planning processes in the future.

Methods

The survey was made widely available through social media, MEC's own communication channels and through the channels of its members. There were 255 responses. Seventy MEC organisations were formally represented (117 responses). There were also responses from 42 individual members of MEC and 96 non-members.

Findings

Early years: There was 100% agreement that music in early years was vital and that every child and parent/carer should have access to quality music provision. The qualitative responses supported this indicating the importance of high quality provision, defining what that means, also highlighting the benefits of early provision, and the need for training and funding.

Entitlement in compulsory schooling: There was 100% agreement that there should be a clear entitlement to music for all children and young people in compulsory schooling. Many of the qualitative comments were supportive of the need for children and young people to access music education in school. Some focused on what was meant by entitlement, while others raised issues about the decline in provision, others the quality of what was on offer.

Opportunities for children and young people: There was very strong agreement to a range of statements relating to the opportunities that every child should have including opportunities to:

- build on early years' experiences and 'catch up' where these are not currently available (100%)
- o create and compose (98%)
- o sing and play instruments together (99%)
- o listen to music (99%)
- o learn about music (99%)
- o critically engage with music (98%)
- o explore many different kinds of music (99%)
- o progress and develop (100%)
- engage fully with quality experiences that enable the individual to make informed choices and fulfil their potential (100%).

The qualitative responses were supportive of children having a wide range of opportunities although some questioned opportunities in particular areas.

Teacher skills: There was 99% agreement that all teachers who are required to teach music should be confident and able to do so. As required in relation to teachers' standards in England they should:

- o adapt teaching to respond to the strengths and needs of all pupils (99%)
- o be able to plan and teach well-structured lessons (99%)
- o be able to promote good progress and outcomes for pupils (99%)
- be able to set high expectations which inspire, motivate and challenge pupils (99%)
- have strong subject knowledge and be able to keep their knowledge up-to-date (98%).

The qualitative statements tended to focus on the issue of quality and there was particular emphasis on primary schools and the extent to which class as opposed to specialist music teachers could meet these criteria.

Partnerships: There was slightly less agreement music is diverse and that schools should be partners within their local Music Education Hubs (MEHs) and that the Hub's rolling development plans should facilitate effective strategic planning and operational delivery that meet the needs of all young people in its own local area, linking with further opportunities regionally and nationally as appropriate (96%). The qualitative responses, while indicating general support for the MEHs, also indicated that there was wide variability in the way that the MEHs functioned. Some were excellent, others were not.

Post compulsory schooling: 99% of respondents agreed or strongly agreed that high quality music education enables lifelong participation in, and enjoyment of, music. For some young people school music education will end at 14; for others, it will continue and may lead to a music related career, including via Further or Higher Education. All options should be open to all. Qualitative comments supported the agreement with the statement but also raised the need for the wide variety of progression paths to be made known to young people, along with career advice.

Next steps

The findings from the survey will feed into MEC's discussion forums, in particular the Special Interest Groups which are being asked to discuss these findings and to make further, more detailed and practical suggestions, taking account of the barriers and sharing examples of good practice. Discussions will continue through MEC news updates and the MEC Seminars on July 6th; September 13th and December 12th 2018. Further surveys will be carried out as necessary in an effort to establish sector-wide consensus. There will be as much consultation as possible within the timescale set by the Government.

MEC fully acknowledges the individual work of its member organisations on behalf of their own membership and the collaborative initiatives, such as the Music Commission, Youth Music's Alliance for a Musically Inclusive England; and the research commissioned on behalf of the MU, MIA and UK Music that will make important contributions to the overall discussion. MEC will not duplicate this work. Rather, MEC offers its members and coalitions of members the opportunity to share their findings across the wider music education sector and be a vehicle for seeking sector-wide agreement.

MEC will continue to examine the current National Plan for Music Education in England and explore what further guidance is needed for the next decade. The aim of such guidance will be to improve understanding and realisation of the plan's intentions, seeking to bring greater clarity where there are differences of interpretation and seeking to improve implementation.

National Plan for Music Education 2020 to 2030 Survey Final report June 2018

Background

During 2017 the Music Education Council (UK) held a series of four seminars entitled 'The Future of Music Education for All – 2018 to 2020 and beyond'. During the seminars, the intrinsic value of music was reasserted alongside the additional benefits that can be realised through high quality musical experiences. The seminars also focussed on social justice, well-being and identity as part of a project with the International Society for Music Education (ISME), for which MEC is the UK's ISME National Affiliate (INA) organisation. Further discussion has continued through MEC's various working groups and information has been shared more widely via MEC News updates.

Although there had been widespread support in England around the intentions underpinning the National Plan for Music Education, over the past decade concerns have arisen with regard to the way the plan has been interpreted and implemented in some places. Furthermore, much has changed since the plan's introduction. At the time of the plan's publication in 2011 the English national curriculum, applicable to all schools, was under review. By 2018 many schools only needed to offer a broad and balanced curriculum with no specific reference to the provision of music. The introduction of the EBacc had negative impact in some schools as research by the University of Sussex' showed although Government data challenged this. Ofsted subject inspections specifically focused on music have ceased and there is no longer a national music subject lead. Cuts to Local Authority budgets have deepened and employment conditions have changed for many teachers. The national funding for Music Education Hubs has changed over time, now at £75m, where it has stayed, cash limited. Music technology has continued to evolve and offers considerable resources for teachers, while many instruments bought almost 10 years ago are no longer fit for purpose. There has been some evaluation related to the implementation of the national plan but it has tended to focus on the quantity of provision rather than its quality offering little in terms of meaningful outcomes or ways of improving provision or its quality. Despite this, there have been many examples of excellent practice and there has definitely been some improvementiii.

Taking account of these factors, MEC decided to address the question: how do we build on and improve current practice? While policy documents and reports^{iv} were felt to be important, they tend to have limited success in changing practice and there are frequently differences between policy intention, interpretation and implementation. MEC therefore decided that only by agreeing a set of principles and actions, reaching out through our networks and memberships to the people working on the front line of music education, and celebrating and sharing practice that works, could we hope to bring about sustainable change for the better.

As an outcome of the MEC Seminar on the Music Curriculum in March 2018, MEC sought to establish the level of agreement around a set of draft statements that could drive the direction of music education over the next two years and inform the development of the National Plan for Music Education (2020 to 2030) in England.

Methods

The survey: The questionnaire was made widely available through social media, through MEC's own communication channels and through the channels of its members. The questionnaire remained open for two months.

The sample: Overall there were 255 responses. 182 (71%) of respondents agreed to being named in the report. (See Annex 1 for a list of those who agreed to their names being published). Seventy MEC organisations were represented with 117 responses. 42 MEC individual members responded and 96 non-members.

Findings

Music in the early years

Table 1 sets out the responses to the statement 'Music in early years is vital.' Every child and parent/carer should have access to quality music provision.' (81 comments).

Table 1: Responses relating to the statement 'Music in early years is vital. Every child and parent/carer should have access to quality music provision.'

Strongly Agree	243	95%
Agree	11	4%
Disagree	1	0.4%
Strongly Disagree	0	0.0%

Percentages have been rounded up or down to the nearest whole number where appropriate

Eighty one people added comments to their responses on Early Years (EY). Seventy-eight of these were from people who strongly agreed with the statement. The remaining three comments were from people who agreed with the statement. The one person who disagreed with the statement did not comment.

Comments frequently repeated the word 'vital' and referred to the importance of quality experiences.

'It is vital to tap into this ability from the beginning of a child's life.'

'It should not only be vital it should be an entitlement.'

'It is the right of every young person to have access to high quality music provision.'

'All children should have access to high quality music education in the early years to make the most of this window of opportunity.'

Respondents pointed out that it was necessary to define quality and find agreement as a sector to support parents and carers.

The challenge is the definition of Quality Music Provision is variable depending on who you talk to and parents/carers won't necessarily recognise quality!'

'Some parameters for exactly what defines 'quality provision' would be helpful.'

The amount of research and evidence that demonstrates the importance of starting young was mentioned by many respondents. In addition to the musical skills and the support for bonding between child and parent/carer in the early stages, many other benefits of music were referenced.

'Of course this is vital. All evidence shows how music develops cognitive skills from birth upwards.'

'Children need the opportunity to develop vital pulse, pitch and listening skills within the physical bond between child and parent/carer.

'Music is a skill that encourages creative thinking, good listening skills and self-expression.'

'Music in Early Years is vital for developing language, creativity, memory.'

'Giving all parents/carers confidence to sing with their children provides lifelong rewards in so many ways.'

'Placing early years at the heart of the NPME will be transformative for children and young people, particularly for those with special needs.'

'It is the absolute foundation of all later work. EYFS¹ music captures the young child's natural desire to respond to pulse, sing and move. Group music making also establishes essential social interactions, like sharing and turn taking that other educational activity relies on.'

'Music develops vital skills for any child in the EYFS! Music is key to the development of young children, laying the foundations for LEARNING!!! It is at the centre of key skills such as communication/confidence/motor skills/physical development/language/maths...the list is endless!'

The importance of training was also mentioned by several respondents.

'Early Years providers need appropriate training.'

'Staff should be properly trained and have real musical skills.'

'There should be more education and training for EY providers.'

'There are significant training and development issues around this.'

'Early Years providers need appropriate training so that they are confident to sing (not all are confident to do this) with young children and initiate their pupils' musical learning.'

'Without a coherent early years infrastructure and trained people, this will remain a utopian dream or limited to those who can afford it.'

Funding was mentioned.

'Yes, but only if there is additional funding made available.'

'Whilst I feel it is unlikely that if EY is added to Hub roles there will be extra funds for this I do think Hubs should be free to use their MEH grant for EY if they feel that is appropriate.'

Singing was mentioned by a number of respondents.

'Everyone can sing, it is the first way in which a child can be part of a team.'

'Particularly singing as this is the fundamental for all music making.'

Some respondents suggested that having an Early Years strategy should be a requirement for Hubs. One response from a hub, having explained how they are already finding evidence of their Early Years programme impacting positively on children's learning across the curriculum, in terms of listening, fine motor skills, communicating together, resilience and well-being, concluded:

'As a Hub, we are excited about the implications of the impact this will have on Key Stage 2 WCET² and how expectations, and as a result, progress at Key Stage 2, will inevitably rise.'

-

¹ EYFS Early Years Foundation Stage

Music in compulsory schooling

Table 2 sets out the responses to the statement 'There should be a clear entitlement to music for all children and young people in compulsory schooling.

Table 2: Responses to 'There should be a clear entitlement to music for all children and young people in compulsory schooling.'

Strongly Agree	246	96%
Agree	8	3%
Disagree	0	0.0%
Strongly Disagree	1	0.4%

Percentages have been rounded up or down to the nearest whole number where appropriate

Seventy-six respondents commented. Seventy comments were from respondents who strongly agreed with the statement, five comments were from respondents who agreed with the statement and one comment was from the respondent who disagreed strongly with the statement. This respondent stated:

'Music should be a core part of the curriculum. - Evidence that music develops everyday tasks like memory, planning and emotional perception, self-discipline, attentiveness.'

The comments from four of the five respondents who agreed with the statement were largely related to the meaning of 'entitlement'.

'Not clear what is meant by "entitlement to music". Do you mean actual participation in music making or passive attendance or other?'

'The nuance is what the 'entitlement' looks like - perhaps something outside of the curriculum would enable music to be much more young-person centred.'

'The word 'entitlement' is very clear in meaning, but it's application in practice is less clear.'

'Entitlement could suggest minimum entitlement (e.g. pupils in schools are entitled to one year of music ...). So I think 'entitlement' is something that needs to be unpacked, lest music education be reduced to a low/lowest common denominator. '

The other respondent who agreed with the statement commented

'There should, but this musical offer should be inclusive and engaging. If young people don't enjoy the music they're obliged to make in school, this could put them off for life!'

Many of those who strongly agreed with the statement were moved to add further supportive comments.

'Absolutely! Musical involvement is every child's birth-right as stated in the United Nations Rights of the Child. Children are highly adept at learning musical skills when taught from an early age by a skilled and knowledgeable teacher. It is often the teacher that holds back progress due to lack of subject knowledge and pedagogy.'

² WCET Whole Class Ensemble Tuition

'Absolutely. It has been proved time after time that music education makes children better learners across the curriculum.'

'Again, I have seen first-hand the impact that whole-school approaches can have on the children and their families.'

'And a good quality, accessible, relevant and affordable entitlement at that.'

'As part of in-school experience in Music classroom time. Not only about performing, but also composing and not only extra-curricular. An entitlement to weekly sessions with a Music specialist.'

'Music is central to our wellbeing & should be an intrinsic part of children's/young people/adults growth & education... 'from the cradle to the grave' & every step in between So yes in compulsory schooling - but beyond too...'

'Music is part of being human and required for a balanced development. It is too important to be left to chance. It is a way of thinking and engaging intelligently with emotions not to mention skills of listening, leadership, tenacity and abstract thinking required for creativity and problem solving. Our young people have to face an unknown future and need all the help they can get!!'

'This is absolutely essential! It's a human right to experience cultural education. Enshrining entitlement to music within education (all types of schools) is crucial in ensuring ALL young people have the opportunity to participate in a meaningful music education.'

'Three points here: 1) Music for music's sake! 2) Music makes you feel good about yourself and everyone around you. 3) Music has such a positive impact on young people's social, emotional and academic progress.'

'Vital for health and wellbeing on top of all other benefits.'

Some respondents expressed concern.

'All too often music and the arts are being squeezed out of the busy school day (or squeezed in when there is time) compulsory schooling goes some way to preventing this.'

'Provision should be made by the government that music is to be viewed as essential - leaving this to heads and local authorities means that music is frequently overshadowed by league tables.'

'This theoretically already exists (and the DfE regularly state that it does), but because it is not policed/monitored and is not going to be as long as there is a continued autonomy for Academies/Free schools etc, no Ofsted checks etc.'

The other issue commented upon related to quality.

'The issue here is over the quality of that provision (a word present in question 5, but not 6). High standards are, unfortunately, not the norm at present, with many children receiving poor-quality (regardless of how well-meaning) musical experiences in both primary and secondary schools. Schools where music isn't done well are then hiding behind the EBacc to make the decision to reduce the level of provision.'

'Yes, but the emphasis should be on quality music education not just any music education. I believe the Kodály approach is the future of music education.'

Opportunities for young people

Table 3 sets out the responses to a series of statements about the opportunities which should be available for young people.

Table 3: Opportunities available for children and young people

Every child should have opportunities to:	Strongly Agree	Agree	Disagree	Disagree Strongly
Build on early years' experiences and 'catch up'	89%	11%	0%	0%
where these are not currently available	228	27	0	0
Create and compose	85%	13%	1%	0.4%
	218	33	3	1
Sing and play instruments together	95%	5%	0.4%	0%
	242	12	1	0
Listen to music	93%	6%	0%	0.4%
	238	16	0	1
Learn about music	89%	10%	0.4%	0%
	228	26	1	0
Critically engage with music ^{vi}	82%	16%	1%	0.4%
	209	42	3	1
Explore the many different kinds of music	88%	11%	0.4%	0%
	225	29	1	0
Progress and develop	92%	8%	0%	0%
	234	21	0	0
Engage fully with quality experiences that	93%	7%	0%	0%
enable the individual to make informed	238	17	0	0
choices and fulfil their potential				

Percentages have been rounded up or down to the nearest whole number where appropriate

Sixty-three respondents commented on this statement. As it was not possible to comment on each element separately, comments covered a number of points and respondents wrote in some detail. Of those who disagreed with one or more elements of the statement, two commented.

'I've put 'disagree' for learning about music or critically engaging with music in early years as having an academic focus so young is often the un-doing of many teachers'/practitioners' delivery in being able to offer a joyful, open and creative experience....Also - a caveat on 'listen to music' - yes very important but guidance and resources desperately needed in the mainstream nursery sector on what types of music (and when to play them) other than the plethora of pop CDs available in early years catalogues, etc. I'm not sure what you mean by 'progress and develop' - in terms of their musical skills / musicality or generally? Most kinds of musical experience are developmental for early years children on one level or another, except ones that are damaging to the ear-drums (for instance), inappropriate or just boring.'

'Critically engage with music Disagree – not a necessity to critically engage with the music.'

Two other respondents also used the word 'disagree' but from a different perspective.

'I doubt anyone will disagree with any of these.

'Who could possibly disagree with any of this?'

Two respondents picked up on 'catching up' where early years opportunities haven't been available.

'Not sure realistically how a child would be able to "catch up" without 1:1 tuition.'

'Not sure about the 'catch-up' idea for early years. If it isn't there in the first place, it's too late. Suggest the catch-up term is unhelpful /misleading'

Respondents also commented on the need for further discussion and clarification regarding what we mean by certain terms.

'I wonder if we have a shared understanding of phrases such as: 'critically engage'; 'Explore'; 'Progress and develop'. 'Engage fully';'

'I strongly agree with 'progress and develop' as currently written i.e. in its broadest interpretation - though they are terms that need clarification and I have found tend to be understood in a very specific and narrow way.'

'Progress and develop' indicates to me particular assumptions about music education. i.e., passing grade exams.....I do not see this as an essential aspect of enjoying a musically rich experience in learning.'

Composing and creativity was mentioned by several respondents.

'Creativity is incredibly important. Engaging specialists in this area is very rewarding for schools and individuals alike'

'Group composing using a variety of sound sources (including computer-generated) is currently undervalued, but can actually be hugely beneficial and rewarding.'

'Create and compose is a difficult area - at key stage 3 I would say it's is an essential part of music education but in KS1 time is much better spent on performing and at KS2 it is often of little relative worth as an activity unless pupils have attained quite a high level of musical awareness.'

'Creativity, performance and ensemble opportunity are particularly important.'

'I do think there isn't a sufficient focus on composing and creating music from scratch - our curricular tends to be too performance based.'

'My view is that collaborative and creative music making has the potential to be the most meaningful and impactful for a child, in terms of musical, personal and social development.'

'Too often 'create and compose' and 'have access to different instruments' means that children are given instruments in a class setting, they have no basic music skills such as a sense of pulse, pitch and rhythm. Then they are given vague and specious composing tasks without developing musical skills outside the context of that particular lesson. A proper programme of musical literacy based on singing and the Kodaly method would make subsequent instrumental learning and composing far more meaningful.'

A number of comments were again very positive, reinforcing the points made in the statements.

'All of the above are essential and integral to a musical education and experience.'

'All of these opportunities are a vital part of young people's education.'

'And this should be available in school time as part of the normal curriculum.'

'I think this broad and creative approach to music learning is essential going forward not just to create a new generation of musicians but to enable all, regardless of circumstances to access the enormous range of wider benefits that come from a deep engagement with music.'

'Each of the aspects above are indispensable to developing healthy, well developed and behaved children.'

'Every child should be able to experience music and the pleasure it can bring.'

'Having a breadth of experiences within music and across the arts helps develop deeper understandings of the world.'

'I think this broad and creative approach to music learning is essential going forward not just to create a new generation of musicians but to enable all, regardless of circumstances to access the enormous range of wider benefits that come from a deep engagement with music.'

Reference was also made to learner choice; access to information and guidance on education, skills and careers in music and the creative industries; and the need to include folk music as part of our cultural heritage. The need for a skilled workforce was also commented upon.

'Unfortunately, many music teachers are not able to enable pupils to realise their potential, owing to their own lack of musical ability. Conversely, in schools where music teachers are 'the musician in the classroom', pupils thrive and can achieve great things.'

This is explored in more detail in the next section.

The quality of teaching

Table 4 sets out the responses to the statements relating to the quality of teaching vii.

Table 4: Responses to what teachers should be required to do

	Strongly	Agree	Disagree	Disagree
	Agree			Strongly
Adapt teaching to respond to the strengths and	91%	8%	0.4	0%
needs of all pupils	233	21	1	0
Be able to plan and teach well-structured	85%	14%	1%	0%
lessons	216	36	3	0
Be able to promote good progress and	87%	12%	0.4	0%
outcomes by pupils	223	31	1	0
Be able to set high expectations which inspire,	90%	9%	1%	0%
motivate and challenge pupils	229	23	3	0
Have strong subject knowledge and be able to	84%	15%	1%	0.4%
keep their knowledge up-to-date	214	37	3	1

Percentages have been rounded up or down to the nearest whole number where appropriate

These statements produced the highest number of comments (87). It was not possible to comment on each element separately. As a result, comments covered a number of points and respondents wrote in some detail.

'a. Have strong subject knowledge and be able to keep their knowledge up-to-date Strongly agree – more and more teachers are teaching music without the qualifications / knowledge

that they need to teach. Increasingly computer software is becoming a good learning tool to improve this (e.g. Charanga) b. Be able to set expectations high which inspire, motivate and challenge pupils Agree. Young people always exceed expectations when expectations are set high. Music has big social aspect and perhaps this is the way in. Thinking about some of the schools we work in, it's very much about participating first and they hope standards will come second. c. Be able to promote good progress and outcomes by pupils Strongly agree. This publicises role modelling to show what's achievable. Exposure and visibility is key, especially when music is so cool. Need to learn from sport here. d. Be able to plan teach well-structured lessons There is a lot of emphasis on structure and I think a more creative space should allow more freedom for wiggle room. What happened to go to the music area and bash stuff around working in groups? I think there needs to be more space for that in learning here, so more time for play and taking risks. The lack of risk taking is what's creating some robot musicians. e. Adapt teaching to respond to the strengths and needs of all pupils Agree – tricky to do with the right skillset in the classroom, this could be developed more outside the classroom if the right students that have potential are pushed further It's important, but doesn't meant teacher has to do live. Signposting to other things is vital. Inspire great example. - Peripatetic teachers should be used more creatively in school time. They should be available to run ensembles, work with secondaries and feeder primaries to support the drop off in year 7, and run masterclasses for schools. - Teachers should also have the opportunity to shadow other tutors that work in their field. - Peer-learning is also a valuable opportunity where students can learn from students their age. - Loosening grip of adults on their students should be encouraged. A wider knowledge of musical opportunities and experiences will create a more well-rounded musician.'

Of those who disagreed with one or more elements of the statement there were four further comments. These are included here in full.

'I believe music should feature in lessons in a manner similar to literacy does at the moment. Songs about maths, instructions sung or chanted in PE, history taught through song etc. As such a teacher doesn't necessarily require specialist knowledge. There are plenty of resources available for even the most hesitant non-musical teacher. In addition high quality music education should be offered to all. Save the music services who provide access in a non-elitist way. Bring back funding for access to music for all '

'I think it is hard to say 'all teachers' here - thinking about non-specialist primary school teachers in particular, but also secondary school teachers who teach music as well as other subjects. I think there needs to be access to expertise/support/advice and resources for 'all teachers' and knowledge and understanding how to access that is vital. This is where Music Services/Hubs can contribute to the musical education of children and young people as a partner with schools.'

'I'm not so sure about a 'structured lesson' per se, certainly not always, but to teach music in early years following children's interests and following specific techniques and ideas in the flow of a day or session.'

'What is meant by well-structured lessons?'

Several respondents referred to issues of confidence, and being intimidated by the subject through being 'non-specialists.' There was a call for investment into local training and more time on ITT courses.

'I believe the lack of skills and confidence in what seems to be the majority of primary generalist teachers is a crucial aspect we need to address.'

'Primary teachers, especially, have the minimum of training on ITE courses in music - a subject which many are actually "afraid" of. Music is frequently the subject primary teachers are the least confident in teaching but has the smallest amount of teacher education time on PGCE and other similar routes to QTS, or in CPD once in-post.'

'Teacher development is key in quality outcomes for children and young people.'

'Teachers need to gain confidence in music teaching through appropriate apprentice learning and music making themselves.'

'Too many children miss out on music at primary school because teachers do not have the skills and/or confidence to teach it. This isn't good enough.'

'With appropriate training, and ongoing support from professional musicians, class teachers could be trained to teach music confidently and competently. The above list is what should be expected of teachers in any lesson, with any age group, in any subject.'

Nevertheless, the issue of whether any music is better than none also arose.

'I feel that the above are ideals and that is how we should aspire for all teachers to be. However, if teachers fall short of some of these standards and there is no-one else to do the job as well as them in their area then I feel that they should still be able to teach.....Some knowledge is better than none.'

For several others, the view is that there should be no compromise.

'The teacher is the most important variable. Poor teaching will lead to lack of engagement and lack of progress in almost every case. Of course the opposite is also true. The gift of the outstanding teacher really makes a difference.'

'As with any subject Music should be taught by a specialist who understands, loves and is passionate about their subject.'

'Quality of teaching is essential if the Plan is to fulfil its aspirations.'

'High quality music teaching is a combination of subject knowledge and the ability to present the subject in a way that is suitable for the learners to learn. Subject knowledge is critical.'

'Music teachers are often under qualified and do not have the depth of knowledge that is required by other subjects. Music should not be any less important in a child's education, and the teachers should appropriately experienced and qualified.'

'Strong musical knowledge, not just subject knowledge.'

'They should be qualified music teachers or specialists with good knowledge of music pedagogy and methodology.'

The need to break the cycle was raised.

'I teach trainee teachers. They have hardly any time in their training relating to music education and as many had little music in their own schooling, their confidence and subject knowledge is frequently lacking.'

'Time for schools and governments to stop pretending that music can be taught by non-specialists. A few sessions on music in a PGCE or even B ed. course will not prepare a teacher to be able to give appropriate challenging lessons unless they have considerable personal musical experience.'

And solutions for existing teachers were also offered.

'This is where Hubs come in. We can support schools and their teachers by offering CPD that:
1) Demonstrates how to teach music 2) Work alongside teachers to equip them with the knowledge and understanding to deliver high quality music lessons in their own settings. 3) Advise teachers on suitable resources to support their teaching and learning.'

Partnerships beyond schools or clusters of schools

There was a statement about the extent to which schools and Music Education Hubs (MEHs) worked together and the nature of the work of MEHs. The full statement was 'Music is diverse. Schools should be partners within their local Music Education Hubs'ii. The Hub's rolling development plans should facilitate effective strategic planning and operational delivery that meet the needs of all young people in its own local area, linking with further opportunities regionally and nationally as appropriate. 77% (196) of respondents strongly agreed with this statement, 20% (50) agreed, 4% (9) disagreed and no-one strongly disagreed.

Eighty one comments were included in response to these interrelated statements. Fifty-seven comments were from respondents who strongly agreed with the statement, 19 were from people who responded 'agree' to the statement and five were from respondents who disagreed with the statements.

Two of those who disagreed with the statements questioned whether hubs should continue and a third commented that hubs are too large. The other two comments related to a narrow offer and there being many other organisations in addition to the hub in an area. This theme of other partners was also continued in those who nonetheless responded in agreement with the statements, often with particular reference to the nature of 'partnerships'.

'The notion of 'partnership' needs to be unpacked'

'Please be aware that some organisations such as [name] lie outside the hub and continue to offer quality tuition and ensembles'

'Not just hubs – other musical enterprises as well'

'Schools should be an integral part of the hub'

'There is clearly scope for greater collaboration between the state and private sectors, too.'

'In an ideal world there would be collaborative working between many organisations and schools and communities – music outside of school is also really important!'

'Voluntary, independent and bespoke music organisations should also have the opportunity to be partnered with schools to aid music hubs and spread the funding pots, work load and reach.'

'Emphasis is here needed on partnership, not an annex of extra-curricular music. A fluid and inter-related and multi-modal dynamic needs to be communicated.'

'I agree as far as this statement goes. I think it should, however, go more widely to talk about other opportunities available such as those provided by NPOs and youth arts organisations.'

'Music Hubs should embrace all types of providers regardless of whether they are part of the 'not for profit' or 'profit making' sectors providing they are committed to providing a high quality music education offer.'

'Schools are not the only partners in a Hub. It is important that Hubs not only link with opportunities that support the needs of young people but that they engage in an ongoing dialogue with community musicians and community music orgs to take into account the planning and delivery of organisations with overlapping and different approaches and aims. It is also important the young people understand the therapeutic and social power that music can have and its importance in a culturally rich and healthy society.'

'The hubs vary in success. They need to be more outward looking. In my experience they do not always seek meaningful partnerships with schools but mainly want to recruit pupils to their activities.'

Even those who strongly agreed with the statement didn't always feel that this was working in practice. Several respondents referred to the patchy nature of provision and differences in funding leading to inequalities. Some referred to schools not engaging with hubs and others to hubs not engaging with schools.

'It is sad that there are currently schools who do not engage with their music hub and therefore have poor access to music education opportunities.'

'It is unfortunately the case that in some parts of the country MEHs are still unknown in some schools! There is a lack of proactive communication from a good number of hubs.'

'This is a difficult question to respond to. I agree entirely that Hubs should facilitate everything mentioned. Coverage, however, is patchy with some hubs delivering poor value for money and not providing high-quality experiences. When pupils are reluctant to engage with hub activity because standards are higher in school, something is sadly wrong. On the other side of this, many hubs (the majority?) are providing amazing, life-changing opportunities for pupils.'

Many respondents commented positively as well as agreeing strongly.

'There are so many benefits to be had through engaging with others beyond your own environment that this must form part of the requirement. '

'The Lead Partner of MEHs play a crucial role in making opportunities happen or in signposting to schools. School music Heads of Dept are mega-busy and can benefit hugely from quality external provision appropriate to their student cohort. They need to see the bigger picture and feel part of a subject-specific professional group.'

'The linkage between hubs and schools is critical. Support provided by the hub needs to be strategic and evidence-based.'

'This is essential, and can hopefully build networks of schools in a world where academisation has made this fractured in places.'

'This is essential. Hubs should be aiming for 100% engagement with schools and be able to construct a pyramid of opportunities leading to regional and national ensembles.'

'This is the gold standard. In practice, in the increasingly fractured educational world with so many different types of schools operating in parallel educational universes, this is increasingly challenging.'

'To ensure that children are getting the best possible deal in their music learning, schools and hubs must work closely together.'

'Yes, there are many possibilities to create exciting partnerships, and many hubs are already doing so.'

Opportunities post school

The statement relating to opportunities post school was 'High quality music education enables lifelong participation in, and enjoyment of, music. For some young people school music education will end at 14; for others, it will continue and may lead to a music related career, including via Further or Higher Education. All options should be open to all.' Eighty-seven percent (222) of respondents strongly agreed with this statement, 12% (31) agreed while 1% (2) strongly disagreed.

Fifty four respondents included comments to these interrelated statements. Most positively reinforced the sentiments of the statements.

'A student should be able to choose music as an option because of their skill set and not whether they are economically suited to this option.'

'Indeed. And it should be compulsorily available to 14'

'Again I agree strongly and would also add that Hubs are well placed to either deliver or signpost music opportunities to CYP post 18.'

'It should be accessible to all for at all ages.'

'Yes, and it is these pathways that are the entitlement for young people. They should have the choice to develop in Music as much as in Science or Maths.'

'Open and inclusive.'

'Our role as educators is to offer a broad and diverse range of musical opportunities for children to experience so they can find their specific avenue to follow as a lifelong pursuit.'

'I believe it is vital to support the many different pathways that a young person may take.'

Other comments related to further considerations that would be needed to realise the statements in practice.

'A really diverse approach to and understanding of progression is important.'

'Progression routes need to be widely advertised.'

'Transition in music education needs to be joined together. Paths worked on and not isolated by the education services or the youth providers. Options need to be just that, choices and not be taken away.'

'For harder to reach young people and those in challenging circumstances additional and individualised support should be considered.'

'Careers advice across the creative industries needs to improve.'

'Creative industries should be accommodated within hubs, particularly allied health provision.'

'Transition in music education needs to be joined together.'

'There are many opportunities at HE but they will become more restricted if there is less demand from schools.'

'If we are going to include specific reference to FE and HE, it should also reference technical education and apprenticeships.'

'We need to work together to raise awareness of Higher Education opportunities available to young people.'

'Need to join the dots between formal and informal learning for people to be able to know of local opportunities regardless of age etc.'

'Lifelong participation in music doesn't have to be achieved through formal 'education.'

'Young people need continued support to transition from 'formal music education' to lifelong musical engagement and pathways into the profession.'

Research

Respondents were asked whether they were carrying out any research which would be relevant to the ongoing discussions. Fifty-four respondents said 'yes' and 201 said 'no'. There were a total of 67 comments where respondents shared information about a number of local evaluations of projects and research activity. Other major pieces of research being planned were also shared. Some respondents expressed a willingness to help.

Next steps

The findings from this survey will feed into MEC's various discussion forums. In particular, the Special Interest Groups are being asked to discuss these findings and to make further, more detailed and practical suggestions, taking account of the barriers while also sharing examples of good practice. Discussions will continue through MEC news updates and the MEC Seminars on July 6th; September 13th and December 12th 2018. Further surveys will be carried out as necessary in an effort to establish sector-wide consensus. There will be as much consultation as possible within the timescale set by the Government.

MEC fully acknowledges the individual work of its member organisations on behalf of their own membership and the collaborative initiatives, such as the Music Commission, Youth Music's Alliance for a Musically Inclusive England; and the research commissioned on behalf of the MU, MIA and UK Music that will make important contributions to the overall discussion. MEC will not duplicate this work. Rather, MEC offers its members and coalitions of members the opportunity to share their findings across the wider music education sector and provide a vehicle for seeking sector-wide agreement.

MEC will continue to examine the current National Plan for Music Education in England and explore what further guidance is needed for the next decade. The aim of such guidance will be to improve understanding and realisation of the plan's intentions, seeking to bring greater clarity where there are differences of interpretation and seeking to improve implementation.

Annex 1 List of organisations and individuals that contributed and agreed to being named:

Organisations

ABO ABRSM

Awards for Young Musicians

Berkshire Maestros
BHT Early Education

BCU BKA

Bristol Plays Music

Bromley Youth Music Trust

Creative United

Choir Schools Association

Charanga Creative United Dalcroze UK Drake Music

Drake Music Scotland English Folk Dance and Song

Society

Harmony Associates

ISM

Liverpool Philharmonic Luton Music Service MERYC-England

MMA MPA

Music for Youth

Music House for Children

MIA

Music Mark Musical Futures

MU NAMHE

National Youth Orchestra of

Great Britain

North Tyneside Music Edn

Hub

One Education Music
Oxfordshire County Music

Service

Plymouth Music Hub Plymouth Youth Music

Service PMLL

Redbridge Music Service

ROH

RSL Rock School

Scottish Association for

Music Education

Sing Up

Sound and Music Sound Connections

Sound Sense Suffolk County Music

Service

The Voices Foundation

Tri-borough Music Hub Trinity College London Trinity Laban Conservatoire of Music and Dance

University of Wolverhampton Victoria College Exams

Wells Cathedral School Wigmore Hall

Young Voices Foundation

Youth Music

Individuals

Lincoln Abbotts
Deborah Aitchison

Claude Alexander Shelly Ambury Anthony Anderson

Emma Archer Zoe Armfield Alison Armstrong Adam Assen Cadwein Bacon

Chris Bailey Michael H. Bailey Danielle Ballantine

Paul Balmer
Emma Beaton
Victoria Bennett
Rebecca Berkley
Marie Bessant
Dr Sarah Browne
Kathryn Burke
Nicola Burke
Pam Burnard

Margarita Burrell M. Burton Dr John Carnelley Madeleine Casson Phil Castang

Barbara Cavanagh Paula Child

Francesca Christmas Ruth Churchill Dower Hester Cockcroft Robert Costin Cindy Crossland

David Cowdy
Jude Cummins

Christopher Dalladay

Adele Drake Ally Daubney Richard Davies Sarah Derbyshire

Julie Digby Jane Dyball Graham Dowdall Leslie East

Leslie East Clare Edwards Rachel Elliott Martin Fautley Judith Finlay John Finney

Philip Flood

Jan Ford

Christopher Foster
Lucy Fowler
Dan Francis
Gordon Francis
Peter Garden
Don Gillthorpe
Sarah Goldsmith
Sarah Gray
Zoe Greenhalgh
Matt Griffiths
David Hall
Rich Hall

Rich Hall
Richard Hallam
Susan Hallam
Maureen Hanke
Fran Hannan
Jane Harland
Alison Harmer
Fiona Harvey
Patrick Healy
Steven Henderson
Jonathan Hering
Simon Hester
Ian Hird
Kathy Hulme

Emma Hutchinson Pippa Hyde Lindsay Ibbotson

Ryan Humphrey

Catherine Inman
Vincent Iyengar
Barbara Johnstone
Richard Jones
Sally Kee
Philip Kennedy
Philip Kennedy
Simon Kirk
Zoe Konez

Nicoletta Kulcsarne Olvaso

Hilary Lawson Emma Lines Richie Littler Bethany Clare Lyden Julia MacDonell Debbie Madden Asa Malmsten Stu Marchant Helen Mason Marcie McCarthy Paul McManus Kamey McNamara **Grace McNeill Tony Mealings** Anita Memmott **Andy Meyers**

Helen Julia Minors David Morrison Liz Muge Paul Neville Sue Newman Francis Norman Leigh O'Hara

Tim Palmer

Ed Milner

Jane Parker Jenni Parkinson Ken Parr

Fiona Pendreigh Isobel Perl Kelly-Jo Peters

Jessica Pitt Carol Reid Judith Robinson Julia Roderick Jimmy Rotheram Kate Rounding Ian Rowe

Jessica Rowe Tim Sandford Edwina Sharp Mike Simpson

Paul Smith Viki Smith Gary Spruce Mary-Alice Stack Mike Simpson Steve Spencer

Mary-Alice Stack Phillip Stallwood Kevin Stannard Vanessa Stansall

Ann Stott
David Stowe
Daisy Swift
Guy Swinton
Mark Swinton
Nigel M Taylor

Nerissa Taysom

PJ Tedd

Roy Terry Ian Thomas Stavroula Thoma Matthew Thomason Stewart Thompson

Nick Thorne
Giles Turner
Philip Trumble
Angela Turton
Henry Vann
Ellara Wakely
Kerry Watson
Kim Waldock
Judith Webster
Gina Westbrook
Paul Weston
Jonathan Westrup

Jonathan Westrup Stuart Whatmore Nicola Whiteside Bridget Whyte Diane Widdison Ivor Widdison Helen Wiles Alex Williams Jenny Williams Graeme Wilson Mick Wilson

Katherine Zeserson Sally Zimmermann

iv Examples include the following.

Several guidance documents and reports are available at http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/

2011 Effective partnership working in music education: Principles and practice. Hallam, R. IJME 29(2) 155-171

2012 Music Education Grant 2011/2012 Report based on Local Authority data returns

http://www.dickhallam.co.uk/resources/National%20Music%20Education%20Grant%202012%20final.pdf 2014 Music Service Trends. Hallam R http://www.dickhallam.co.uk/research-reports.php

2014 Inspiring Music for All: next steps in improvement, integration and innovation. Zeserson, K with Professor Graham Welch, Sarah Burn, Dr. Jo Saunders and Dr. Evangelos Himonides Paul Hamlyn Foundation

https://www.phf.org.uk/publications/inspiring-music/

2014 Key Data on Music Education Hubs 2013 https://www.nfer.ac.uk/publications/MEHC01

2014 Making Music (ABRSM) https://gb.abrsm.org/fileadmin/user_upload/PDFs/makingMusic2014.pdf

2014 MU Music Education Hubs: the real picture so far https://www.musiciansunion.org.uk/Files/Reports/Industry/MU-Education-Hubs-Report-2014

2015 The power of music: a research synthesis of the impact of actively making music on the intellectual, social and personal development of children and young people Hallam, S. Publisher: iMERC ISBN: 978-1-905351-31-2

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/273126443_The_power_of_music_a_research_synthesis_of_the_impact_of_ac tively making music on the intellectual social and personal development of children and young people

2015 Using Quality Principles in work for, by and with Children and Young People

http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-

file/Using_Quality_Principles_in_work_for_by_and_with_children_and_young_people_2015.pdf

2015 MU The National Plan for Music Education: the impact on the workforce.

https://www.musiciansunion.org.uk/Files/Reports/Industry/The-National-Plan-for-Music-Education-The-impact-output for the control of the con

2015 Key Data on Music Education Hubs 2014 https://www.nfer.ac.uk/publications/MEHD01

2015 Equality, Diversity & the Creative Case (ACE) 2012-2015

http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-

file/Equality_Diversity_and_the_Creative_Case_A_data_report_2012-2015.pdf

2015 Act Sing Play a research evaluation of the instrumental and vocal learning by pupils http://natcen.ac.uk/our-research/research/act-sing-play-evaluation/

2015 The Provision of Music in Special Education (PROMISE)

https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Graham_Welch/publication/317558975_The_Provision_of_Music_in_Special_Education_PROMISE_2015/links/599f0e294585151e3c6ac9ea/The-Provision-of-Music-in-Special-Education-PROMISE-2015.pdf 2016 Equality, Diversity & the Creative Case (ACE) 2015-2016 http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/Equality_diversity_creativecase_2015_16_web_0.pdf

2016 MU Musicians' Union Hub Report 2016 https://www.musiciansunion.org.uk/Files/Reports/Industry/Musicians-Union-Hub-Report-2016

2016 Young People and Participation in Amateur Music Groups. Research results. Davis, X Making Music

https://www.makingmusic.org.uk/resource/survey-results-young-people-and-participation-amateur-music-groups

2016 Key Data on Music Education Hubs 2015 https://www.nfer.ac.uk/publications/MEHE01

2016 Teachers working together in the Wider Opportunities instrumental programme in the primary school; http://gala.gre.ac.uk/18074/

2016 Whole Class Ensemble Teaching (WCET) Final Report https://www.musicmark.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/WCET-Final-Report.pdf

2017 Connect-Resound Final report https://www.musicmark.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/Connect-Resound-Final-Report-2017.pdf

2017 Music Education, a guide for Governors: providing high quality music education in schools. ACE; NGA; Music Mark http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-

file/ACE172%20Music%20Education%20for%20Governors%20-%20WEB.pdf

2017 ImagineNation: the value of cultural learning Cultural Learning Alliance https://culturallearningalliance.org.uk/about-us/imaginenation-the-value-of-cultural-learning/

2017 MU A review of the current provision of music education in England

https://www.musiciansunion.org.uk/Files/Reports/Industry/MU-2017-Education-Report-8pp-A4

https://www.sussex.ac.uk/webteam/gateway/file.php?name=changes-in-secondary-music-curriculum-provision-2012-16-summary-jan-2018.pdf&site=319

[&]quot;https://www.theyworkforyou.com/wrans/?id=2018-03-19.133248.h&s=music#g133248.r0 Nick Gibb, Minister of State (Education) 27 March 2018

See for example, Leverton School, Bradford https://www.theguardian.com/education/2017/oct/03/school-results-music-bradford

2017 Key Data on Music Education Hubs 2016 BCU http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/key data music report.pdf

2017 The Short Guide to Accessible Music Education www.theshortguidetoaccessiblemusiceducation.wordpress.com 2017 Making Music changing lives Youth Music Impact Report 2016/17 https://www.youthmusic.org.uk/impact-report 2017 Think2020 Drake Music http://www.drakemusic.org/news/released-think2020-paper-disabled-people-in-the-music-education-workforce/

2017 Trends in arts subjects where English Baccalaureate entry has increased. DfE

 $https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/630223/Trends_in_arts_subjects_in_schools_where_English_Baccalaureate_entry_has_increased.pdf$

2017 Youth Music Quality Framework in music-making sessions and for working with young people in SEN/D settings (2 documents) http://network.youthmusic.org.uk/resources/do-review-improve-quality-framework-music-education 2017 Careers strategy: making the most of everyone's skills and talents DfE- 00310-2017 www.gov.uk/government/publications

2017 Creative Health: The Arts for Health and Wellbeing. All-party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing. Inquiry report. www.artshealthandwellbeing.org.uk/appg/inauiry

2018 Guidance for music education hubs – developing an inclusive approach to the core and extension roles Reid, C; Patchitt, S; Holford, A; Mullen, P. Youth Music, ACE, BMT. http://network.youthmusic.org.uk/resources/guidance-music-education-hubs-developing-inclusive-approach-core-and-extension-roles

2018 Exchanging Notes Interim Report: Year 3 Kinsella, V; Fautley, M; Whitakker, A. Youth Music 2018 http://network.youthmusic.org.uk/researches/exchanging-notes-interim-report-year-3

whttp://www.sound-connections.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/Music-in-the-Early-Years-Who-What-Why.pdf

vii All of these statements are part of the Qualified Teacher Standards https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/teachers-standards

viii The Importance of Music provides a flexible template for high quality music provision throughout a pupil's education. (NPME p4). 'Schools...will be expected to provide high quality music education' (NPME p9, 7); all schools, including academies and free schools, should provide high quality music education as part of a broad and balanced curriculum. (NPME p13, 27).

'Great music education is a partnership between classroom teachers, specialist teachers, professional performers and a host of other organisations, including those from the arts, charity and voluntary sectors.' (NPME p3).

'Schools cannot do everything alone: they need the support of a wider local music structure' (NPME p3).

'A music infrastructure that transcends schools is necessary.' (NPME p10, 8).

'Hubs will augment and support music teaching in schools so that more children experience a combination of classroom teaching, instrumental and vocal tuition and input from professional musicians.' (NPME p10, 9) [All references to professional musicians include community musicians; freelance musicians and those employed by professional organisations such as orchestras and opera companies who also work in education].

'Hubs and schools (or clusters of schools) will work together to determine what high quality music education looks like in a local context, and who will be responsible for the delivery of each aspect.' (NPME p16, 31).

'Needs audits will focus on how hubs, schools and other partners can best meet the requirements, and how to target resource most efficiently.' (NPME p17, 35).

'All children can benefit from music, and based on the audit process, hubs will need to consider how to engage and inspire them across this spectrum, to foster their interests and then stretch their boundaries so they experience a range of musical genres and activities which they might not otherwise have explored.' (NPME p17, 37).

'We will expect hubs will take account of this as part of a regular needs analysis and an audit of provision in the area to get a sense of what the 'assets' are on which they can draw (also see paragraphs 34-35). They will use this to plan their services and partnerships around pupils' needs, both in school and more widely. A process of auditing local needs will help give greater accountability and transparency for schools, parents/carers and pupils. (NPME p26,76).

'The audit process should help identify the sorts of children whose musical ability and interest demands extension, including to national opportunities for exceptionally talented young people. (NPME p 27, 77).

vi https://jfin107.wordpress.com/John Finney: My keynote given at the Music Transitions and Futures Conference, The Boiler House, Newcastle University, Newcastle-upon-Tyne on Thursday 25th January 2018.