

Institution: University of Roehampton		
Unit of Assessment: 21 – Sociology		
Title of case study: Active Global and European Citizenship: measuring and monitoring the effectiveness of education policy and practice		
Period when the underpinning research was undertaken: 2014-2020		
Details of staff conducting the underpinning research from the submitting unit:		
Name(s): Bryony Hoskins	Role(s) (e.g. job title): Professor of Comparative Social Science	Period(s) employed by submitting HEI: October 2014 - present
Period when the claimed impact occurred: 2014-2020		
Is this case study continued from a case study submitted in 2014? N		
1. Summary of the impact (indicative maximum 100 words)		
<p>Professor Bryony Hoskins' research focuses on the low level of political engagement amongst young people and the dynamics that underpin it. In collaboration with UNICEF, the World Bank, the Council of Europe and UNESCO, Hoskins' research has, since 2014, been adopted in the development of measurement instruments to assess the effectiveness of education interventions designed to increase active citizenship. These instruments and the accompanying analysis have supported the monitoring of active citizenship and political engagement, and identified effective teaching and learning practices for different social groups on a global level. This work has subsequently shaped international policy as well as educational practice across Europe, the Middle East and North Africa.</p>		
2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)		
<p>Hoskins' research (R1, R2, R3, R4, R5) directly addresses the role of schools in teaching political engagement, how they enhance socioeconomic inequalities in political engagement, and what methods work to reduce these inequalities. Her research tests and proposes solutions to mitigate inequalities and promote greater political engagement amongst young people, regardless of their socioeconomic background.</p> <p>Hoskins analysed various European education systems and their effect on education for active citizenship (R1, R2, R3, G1) and political engagement, identifying, measuring and comparing the citizenship values and political participatory attitudes of young people and the consequences of social inequalities in the learning of citizenship. Through this process, Hoskins has been able to demonstrate the different results produced by education systems that prioritise different teaching methodologies and have contrasting conceptions of active citizenship. Social justice values, citizenship knowledge and skills are particularly facilitated in the Nordic education system, due to the prioritisation of the promotion of autonomous critical thinking in citizenship education in school from an early age. In contrast, this priority may not be the most effective approach to enhance participatory attitudes or concepts of a good citizen, as noted in a comparison to educational approaches developed in medium-term democracies with civic republican traditions, such as Italy and Greece. In these countries, teachers prioritise civic responsibility, which consequently achieves the most positive results for young people's citizenship values and participatory attitudes (R1).</p> <p>In addition to the differences in learning outcomes between educational systems that function under different priorities, Hoskins' research (R2, R3, R5, G1) demonstrates that socioeconomic inequalities tend to negatively influence the political engagement of young people through the type of education that they are offered. In Germany and England, the lowest levels of political engagement (voting or protesting) were seen amongst those who had undertaken low level vocational qualifications, which appear to be reducing their levels of political engagement. As most young people in England who undertake vocational and low-level qualifications are from disadvantaged backgrounds, the education system is thus exacerbating the social reproduction of inequalities in political engagement. Furthermore, young people from disadvantaged backgrounds already have reduced access to participatory forms of learning in two ways. First, within a school, where more advantaged children are involved in student councils and activities such as school debates; and second, between schools, where the schools with a higher</p>		

proportion of advantaged children are involved in more participatory activities and have more open classroom discussions.

Having identified the key factors that result in lack of political engagement and low levels of active citizenship amongst young people, Hoskins elaborated and tested potential solutions in her 2019 monograph (R5). Based on a large scale representative longitudinal dataset that followed young people every two years from the ages of 11 to 23, R5 proposed two paths for developing political engagement: 1) participatory learning processes (i.e. civic participation and student voice opportunities in school) and 2) knowledge transmission on political topics (i.e. citizenship education). The research found that access to these learning opportunities for young people from all social backgrounds was key in the reduction of inequalities in political engagement, which has subsequently been central to the development of citizenship education and political engagement assessment instruments created by Hoskins that have been used across the world.

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

*All articles have been published in high impact peer-reviewed journals

R1 Hoskins, B., Saisana, M. and Villalba, C.M.H. (2014) Civic Competence of Youth in Europe: Measuring Cross National Variation through the Creation of a Composite Indicator, *Social Indicator Research*, 123, pp.431-457. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11205-014-0746-z>

R2 Hoskins, B., and Janmaat, J.G. (2016) Educational trajectories and inequalities of political engagement among adolescents in England, *Social Science Research*, 56, pp. 73-89. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssresearch.2015.11.005>

R3 Hoskins, B., Janmaat, J. G., Han, C., and Muijs, D. (2016) Inequalities in the education system and the reproduction of socioeconomic disparities in voting in England, Denmark and Germany: the influence of country context, tracking and self efficacy on voting intentions of students age 16-18, *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 46(1), pp.69-92. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2014.912796>

R4 Hoskins, B., Janmaat, J.G., and Melis, G. (2017) Tackling inequalities in political socialisation: A Systematic analysis of Access to and Mitigation Effects of Learning Citizenship at School, *Social Science Research*, 68, pp.88-101. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ssresearch.2017.09.001>

R5 Hoskins, B. and Janmaat, J.G. (2019) *Education, Democracy and Inequality: Political Engagement and Citizenship Education in Europe*. London: Palgrave Macmillan. ISBN: 978-1-137-48976-0. Can be supplied by the HEI on request.

G1 ESRC. Grant no. ES/J019135/1. LLAKES Centre Mid-Term Review Proposal (PI; 01/10/2014 - 31/12/2017). £22,549.

G2 UNICEF. *Preparing assessment tools to measure 21st century skills and field trial under the Life Skills and Citizenship Education (LSCE) Initiative* (PI; 01/01/2018 - 28/02/2019). \$122,200 and additional award of \$49,143 (total: \$171,343).

G3 Bosch Stiftung. Identifying effective programme interventions for teaching and learning European Citizenship for disadvantaged young people (PI; 01/01/2019 - 31/12/2019). £44,000.

G4 Bosch Stiftung. Identifying effective programme interventions for teaching and learning European Citizenship for disadvantaged young people (PI; 01/01/2020 - 31/03/2021). £57,738.80.

G5 UNICEF. Preparing assessment tools to measure 21st century skills and field trial under the Life Skills and Citizenship Education (LSCE) Initiative (PI; 05/06/2020 - 31/11/2020). \$54,202.66 and additional award of \$11,060.63 (total: \$65,263.29).

4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

Hoskins' research has been applied to the development of assessment instruments that have been used – in collaboration with UNICEF, the World Bank, the Council of Europe (CoE) and UNESCO – to analyse the quality of education for active citizenship across Europe and countries in the Middle East and North Africa region (MENA). The findings of these assessment exercises have consequently informed the development of education policy across the CoE's forty-seven member states and the MENA region, which greatly benefited young people internationally. In particular, the changes in education policy contributed to the increase of young peoples' levels of

self-confidence, empowering them to express their opinions, to take initiative and participate as more active citizens in their communities.

Since 2015, UNICEF and the World Bank have been working on the development and integration of the Life Skills and Citizenship Education programme (LSCE) in the MENA region. This initiative promotes the integration of life skills in national education systems across the area, aiming to equip all children and young people with skills for lifelong learning, employability, personal empowerment, and active citizenship. From the outset, Hoskins' research (**R1**) has been essential for the successful development and implementation of LSCE. She was first approached in 2015, due to her reputation *'as one of the world-leading experts on measuring Active Citizenship'* (**IMP1**). Subsequently, Hoskins was awarded two grants, both resulting in follow-up funding (totalling \$236,606.29) from UNICEF to support the development of instruments to measure life skills and citizenship education. Alongside regional partners and national Ministries of Education (MoEs) of the MENA region, Hoskins' research on civic competence was used in the development of a conceptual and programmatic framework for key life skills in active citizenship (**R1**), which was published in 2017 (**IMP2**). Her knowledge of effective citizenship education and measurement instruments (**R2, R4, R5**) was used in her evidence-based report published in 2019 (**IMP3**) which covers the available instruments for measuring life skills and how these can be taught effectively (**R5**).

Hoskins' extensive knowledge of the measuring of non-cognitive skills (**R1, R5**) supported the development of a life skills assessment instrument for school that now enables countries to assess the quality and distribution of life skills curricula across the school-aged population. During April 2019, the instrument was tested in Egypt, Palestine, and Tunisia, and was applied in 20 classrooms in each country, reaching 4568 students (**IMP4**). The Egyptian Ministry of Education recognised the relevance of this tool, stating that it *'is very essential and it will help us monitor the impact of the curricula that are dependent on life skills and citizenship education and how they enhance our students' skills'* (**IMP4**). This led the Egyptian education ministry to start the integration at the system-level of standardised life skill assessment. The now finalised measurement instrument, informed by Hoskins' research (**R3, R2**), provides a standardised approach for assessing life skills proficiency targeting the lower-secondary education age group which has informed the approach of UNICEF and the World Bank. According to the UNICEF regional advisor from the MENA regional office, *'UNICEF and The World Bank are currently discussing the application of the measurement instrument as a largescale national assessment in a few countries in the region, and further redeveloping it as a standardized pre-post- intervention instrument to evaluate the effectiveness of specific interventions. [Hoskins'] expertise has enabled significant advancement in measuring life skills in the MENA region and has supported ministries and partners to improve their education systems and interventions and thereby increase the chances that children and young people from the region will get structured teaching of life skills and achieve better life outcomes'* (**IMP1**).

The implementation of LSCE across the MENA region has resulted in significant benefits for the young people involved, leading to an increase in self-confidence, empowering them to find their voice and providing them with the capacity to express their own opinion while also enabling greater cooperation between students, including moving beyond ethnic and national biases. In Jordan, the students noted that the programme led to an increase in their own self-confidence, empowering and encouraging them to participate in more activities, to express themselves both at home and in school, to better recognise their own skills and talents and helping them to make their own decisions, particularly about what they want to do in the future. In Palestine, the programme has been adopted by 220 grade 1-4 schools. In schools in Nablus and Ramallah, the implementation of LSCE led children to learn and apply life skills that are essential for daily life such as how to manage a budget, work with banks, and how to choose the most nutritious fruits and vegetables as well as to cooperate and think critically, to consider their dreams and aspirations for the future and even wonder about the political future of Palestine. The programme was recognised by the Principal of a school for girls in Nablus as one of the best they ever implemented (**IMP5**).

Young people who benefited from the introduction of the LSCE programme in Lebanon also reported an increase in self-confidence and trust in their colleagues and a greater aptitude for expressing their own ideas and collaborating with other students. The programme for older students had a greater focus on leadership, transforming the students' behaviour and opinion concerning key social issues, improving their capacity to communicate and become more active in their community. One Syrian student explained how her own attitude was transformed, from being prejudiced against her Lebanese colleagues to now having developed bonds of friendship with them. Another noted that *'Conflict resolution is the most important thing to me. Now I think differently. To solve a conflict between two people we must establish dialogue between them, to express their opinions, to determine who's right and who's wrong. We are active youth serving our community. We have our role and we have a voice'*. These students have since started working on opening a clinic to address the lack of a hospital in their village and have been cooperating with the municipality to raise awareness of sanitation issues such as the lack of refuse bins in the area or the need to place water filters in schools to address water contamination (**IMP5**).

In 2016, and simultaneously with the work developed with UNICEF and The World Bank, Hoskins collaborated with the Council of Europe (CoE) to ensure the rigorous evaluation and quality implementation of the Charter on Education for Democratic Citizenship (EDC). The EDC, developed by the CoE and adopted by the CoE's forty-seven member states (CM/Rec (2010)7), officially recognises the essential role of education in the promotion of the core values of the CoE. EDC is a crucial reference point for all those dealing with citizenship and human rights education, providing and disseminating good practice guidelines throughout Europe and beyond. In order to monitor and evaluate the implementation of the EDC, the CoE asks the member states to respond to a questionnaire regarding the countries' levels of implementation of the EDC. The result of this assessment is crucial to supporting the development of policy in this field by the member states and CoE. In this context, the CoE have asked for Hoskins' collaboration due to her expertise and *'specialist knowledge in the field of Education for Democratic Citizenship'* (**IMP6**). According to the CoE's Head of Education Policy Division, Professor Hoskins' research has been invaluable in *'1) Improving the quality and rigour of the analysis of the questionnaires from the member states in particular drawing on her expertise in how to assess progress over time [R2, R4, R5] 2) helping to draw findings and policy implications from the analysis and results based on her research in the field in particular on the effect of inequalities in access to learning democratic citizenship [R2, R4, R5]; and 3) Quality assuring the reporting by the Council of Europe to the Member States and civil society organisations [R1, R5]'* (**IMP6**).

This assessment exercise shows that there has been significant progress since 2012. Education for democratic citizenship and human rights has gained more importance throughout Europe, and is increasingly recognised as an essential response to the challenges that face modern societies. Nevertheless, it was recognised that work was needed to increase equality of access to citizenship and human rights learning opportunities. Hoskins' analysis and these findings were included in the 2017 CoE report (**IMP7**), which was presented at the CoE conference in June 2017 to over 400 persons from MoEs, NGOs, educational institutions and practitioners from across Europe. These findings have been used by the CoE to inform and support the member states to fully implement the EDC. The main political outcome from the conference, the CoE Declaration DGII/EDU/CIT (2017)7, adopted Hoskins' research findings (**R2, R4**) in the development of key actions strategy for national governments, specifically under point 2, which aims to *'Ensure quality, balanced provision of EDC/HRE in all areas and types of education, with specific attention paid to areas where EDC/HRE is less present such as pre-school education, vocational education and training, and higher education'*; and point 5 which looks to *'Ensure access to EDC/HRE, paying particular attention to vulnerable and marginalised groups, including young people who are not in education or training'* (**IMP8**). The outcomes from these recommendations will be assessed in 2021.

In partnership with the CoE, UNESCO approached Hoskins in 2020 to develop research into the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic on student voice in secondary schools across Europe and MENA countries. Informed by her research (**R2, R3, R5**), Hoskins created a survey that asked teachers about opportunities for student voice at their schools 6 months before lockdown, and then what was offered to students when the schools were closed. The questions on opportunities for learning

student voice are based on her findings on successful education strategies for learning political engagement that derived from her monograph (R5). Over 1000 teachers completed this survey. The results of this exercise show that opportunities for students to have their voice heard and to learn the competences to assert their rights have significantly decreased due to the pandemic, subsequent school closures and lack of appropriate digital solutions. This has affected the vast majority of students, regardless of geographical location and cultural, social and economic differences, although disadvantaged students have lost out further on having their voice heard and learning the competences for democratic culture (IMP8).

Based on the findings of this project, Hoskins proposed eight policy and practice recommendations to develop resilient and high-quality student voice opportunities within schools. These include building a strong and lively civic culture within the school; the incorporation of student voice initiatives into the school curricula and greater inclusion of disadvantaged students in student voice projects. The research and recommendations from this project were presented at an online conference in November 2020, to 500 teachers, young people, policy makers and researchers from across Europe and the MENA region. Following Hoskins' recommendations, UNESCO and the CoE have committed to develop a strategy to disseminate the recommendations into education practice across Europe and the MENA region including in the development of a policy brief and further publications to support the enhancement of student voice. These materials will be used by UNESCO and the CoE to support and inspire education ministries, schools, teachers and young people across both regions (IMP9).

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

IMP1 Testimonial from the Regional Education Advisor at the MENA Regional Office, focusing on the influence of Hoskins' research and expertise in the development of the LSCE initiative. 09/02/2020.

IMP2 *Reimagining Life Skills and Citizenship Education in the Middle East and North Africa* Conceptual and Programmatic Framework. 2017. It acknowledges Hoskins' expertise (p. ix).

IMP3 *Measuring Life Skills: in the context of Life Skills and Citizenship Education in the Middle East and North Africa*. 2019. Co-authored by Hoskins.

IMP4 Video summary of the trial of the LSCE tool in Egypt, 2019. It includes information concerning the number of children reached and a testimonial from the Ministry of Education.

IMP5 The summaries and testimonials regarding the implementation of LSCE in these countries are available at the UNICEF webpage. <https://www.unicef.org/mena/stories/countries-close-ups>

IMP6 Testimonial from the Head of the Council of Europe Education Policy, focusing on the influence of Hoskins' research and expertise in assessing the implementation of the EDC. 02/12/2019.

IMP7 *Learning to Live Together: Council of Europe report on the state of citizenship and human rights education in Europe*. 2017. It acknowledges Hoskins' collaboration (p.50).

IMP8 DGII/EDU/CIT (2017)7 - Learning to live together: a shared commitment to democracy. Conference on the future of citizenship and Human Rights education in Europe. Strasbourg, 20 – 22 June 2017.

IMP9 Testimonial from the Senior Project Officer, Section of Global Citizenship and Peace Education, at UNESCO, focusing on the relevance of Hoskins research and expertise in the development of the 'Student Voice During the COVID-19 Pandemic' research project. 09/03/2021